

## TOWN OF WAYLAND

41 COCHITUATE ROAD
WAYLAND, MASSACHUSETTS 01778

Personnel Board Nancy McCarthy Maryanne Peabody Jane Evans Philip Schneider Nicholas Willard

John Senchyshyn Asst. Town Administrator/HR Director 508-358-3623 jsenchyshyn@wayland.ma.us

Date:

December 2, 2008

To:

Finance Committee

From:

Personnel Board

Re:

Police - Requested Staffing Change

Police Chief Robert Irving has requested the addition of a new Police Officer position for FY10. In accordance with the Personnel Board's practice to have all proposed staffing changes brought to the Board for review, the Personnel Board met with Chief Irving on October 27, 2008 to review his request. He is seeking approval for an officer's position that was committed to the Police Department in 2003. The requisition is to fill an early retirement that occurred in 2004. Per the 2003 agreement, the position was to remain vacant for a 3-year period, and then be filled. Chief Irving reported that the FinCom indicated last year that, while the position could not be funded in FY09, the request would be revisited as part of the FY10 budget process.

While the Chief's request to fill the vacancy is reasonable and within acceptable staffing parameters, the financial outlook for the Town has changed considerably since 2003, and has certainly changed again since last year's budget review. The Personnel Board appreciates the difficult budget process that is upon us, and is prepared to support the staffing request when it becomes financially feasible.

Cc:

F. Turkington

R. Irving

COMMUNITY OPPORTUNITIES GROUP, INC.

129 Kingston Street Third Floor Boston, Massachusetts 02111

(617) 542-3300

April 20, 2006

Rebecca Regan, Planning Board Wayland Town Hall 41 Cochituate Road Wayland, MA 01778

Reference: Review of Proposed Town Center Developments

Dear Ms. Regan:

You have requested a fiscal and economic impact review of two proposed development options for the Wayland Business Center property. The proposals include a mixed-use development with commercial space and up to 100 housing units, and a 200-unit comprehensive permit development. The former project is similar to a mixed-use development proposed last year, although the amount of commercial space has been reduced to a maximum of 165,000 square feet. This letter is in response to your request.

Our report is organized as follows:

- 1.0 Fiscal Impact Summary
- 2.0 Mixed-Use Overlay District (MUOD) Review
- 3.0 Comprehensive Permit Review
- 4.0 Chapter 40R Option

We would like to thank the Planning Board, Finance Committee, Town Administrator, municipal and school department heads, and the development team for providing information for this review.

COMMUNITY OPPORTUNITIES GROUP, INC.

Judith A. Barrett Project Manager Education. In consultation with the School Superintendent, we have used Wayland's FY 2005 Per Pupil Expenditure (as reported by the Department of Education) to estimate the Town's K-12 school costs for children living in the MUOD. Depending on the grades directly affected by new enrollments, the Town may need to add a bus route. It is premature to estimate this cost. We assumed all school-age children would attend the Wayland Public Schools, and needs for special education services would be consistent with Wayland's existing experience.

<u>Public Safety</u>. Estimating additional public safety costs is more difficult than estimating any other municipal service costs. Our conversations with Wayland's public safety officials, our knowledge of public safety staffing levels in other communities, state and county data reported by the Census of Governments, and industry publications persuade us that Wayland's police and fire departments are already understaffed. It is conceivable that Wayland would postpone increasing its police and fire personnel indefinitely if the MUOD were not built, so perhaps an argument can be made for assigning a much larger public safety cost to the proposed project, i.e., the Town's existing deficit plus costs directly attributable to the development. However, we do not think it is appropriate or methodologically sound to assign the Town's existing deficit to the MUOD or the comprehensive permit development.<sup>3</sup>

The costs shown in Table 5 reflect the following assumptions and procedures. For public safety demands from <u>commercial</u> uses, the cost represents a "proportional valuation" analysis in which Wayland's existing non-residential public safety expenditures are multiplied by the ratio of the project's assessed value to Wayland's total nonresidential assessed value, and thereafter by a marginal cost coefficient.<sup>4</sup> For <u>residential</u> uses, we estimated Wayland's salary, employee benefits and supplies expenditures per police officer and firefighter, <sup>5</sup> and converted the population estimate for this project to a multiplier based on the statewide standard for the average number of police (1.9) and firefighters (2.1) per 1,000 population. The total public safety cost in Table 5, Column B, is the sum of commercial and residential public safety costs estimated with these two methods.

<u>Public Works; Health & Human Services</u>. Estimated costs are based on Wayland's current expenditures per capita multiplied by the mid-point and upper-range population estimates for the project; and commercial costs on a proportional valuation analysis. The development may have little if any direct impact on Wayland's public works functions because the project will be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Our estimate of Wayland's current public safety deficit is approximately \$388,865, assuming the state average of 1.9 officers per 1,000 population and 2.1 career (paid) firefighters per 1,000 population. Wayland does not meet either of these standards. The total cost estimate represents 2.8 police officers (plus employee benefits) and an additional police cruiser, and 3.4 firefighters (with benefits), both multiplied by an entry-level salary assumption and a factor for supplies (see below).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Estimated FY06 nonresidential public safety costs = \$1,479,047; FY06 nonresidential real property assessed value = \$118,743,474; ratio of project value to total nonresidential value = .33; refinement coefficient = .40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Employee benefits calculated at 40% salary costs; a factor for supplies was derived from Wayland's FY06 police and fire budgets (salaries  $\times$  0.08 for police, and salaries  $\times$  0.04 for fire).

The development's total household and school-age populations may vary by 5-6% from the figures reported in Table 4.

### 2.4 Community Service Expenditures

For our previous study, we analyzed Wayland's actual expenditures and revenue, FY 1990-2004, in order to account for long-term financial trends and understand the rates of growth or change that had occurred in various departmental operating budgets. Thereafter, we converted the Town's FY05 departmental appropriations to per capita costs and used them as base multipliers to estimate the cost to serve residents of the MUOD. On a case-by-case basis, these base multipliers were adjusted for marginal cost impacts with coefficients developed from fiscal impact case studies conducted nationally. Modified per capita cost studies are commonly used by fiscal impact analysts when more refined information is unavailable from the unit of local government.

The Town Administrator arranged for us to meet with Wayland's department heads on April 5, 2006, to discuss the MUOD and comprehensive permit proposal. We also met with the Town Administrator individually on March 30, 2006, consulted by telephone with Fire Chief Robert Loomer on April 3, 2006, and had follow-up communication with School Superintendent Gary Burton after the department head meeting. Table 5 provides our revised estimate of municipal and school service costs directly attributable to the proposed MUOD, based on our present understanding of the project. The estimates in Table 5 incorporate information we received from the Town and standard costing practices used in fiscal impact studies.

Table 5: Municipal & School Service Co	ost Estimate (Rounde	ed)	
(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)
General Fund Service Category	Total	Commercial	Residential
General Government	\$0	\$0	\$0
Public Safety	\$211,900	\$165,000	\$46,900
Education	\$168,000	\$0 -	\$168,000
Public Works	\$41,200	\$15,500	\$25,700
Health & Human Services	\$14,630	\$5,790	\$8,840
Culture & Recreation	\$44,260	\$3,860	\$40,400
Total General Fund Services	\$479,990	\$190,150	\$289,840

Table 5 Notes

(1) General Government. The Town Administrator anticipates no additional general government service costs as a direct result of this project. It is his position that Wayland's existing general government operations can absorb any service demands that may be generated by the development, i.e., a de minimus impact. In the future, the Town may want to consider a methodology for measuring the cumulative impacts of new growth on community services.

interior operations (other than rescue) should not be initiated until a total of four personnel arrive on scene.

Presently, the second ambulance serves the Town only as a mechanical backup. When a second ambulance is needed it is requested from another community through mutual aid. Although operating a second ambulance with five personnel on shift is not feasible, placing the second ambulance in service is possible with a six person shift and, as stated earlier, additional revenue can be generated to help offset the added personnel cost.

### Police Facilities and Equipment

The Public Safety Building is shared between the Police and Fire Departments and was dedicated in 2003. The police section of the building encompasses approximately 13,828 square feet, including the entire dispatch area, storage, and ½ of the gym. The building is equipped with key card access on external and some interior doors. Office space is sufficient for the immediate future, but when additional designated space is needed, one option would be to consider disassembly of the gymnasium that is shared with the Fire Department. The Wayland Police cell block area, an area of concern in many communities, is clean, neat, up to code, and of sufficient number for future need increases.

The Police Department has been able to keep up with the fast moving trends in police technology. The Department utilizes live scan fingerprinting, laptops in cruisers, and video monitoring of the police station. The radio system is constantly being upgraded and currently enjoys a system with all Motorola components, with no outstanding radio issues. Sworn officers are issued Glock 40 caliber side arms that are now approximately 5 years old. Cruisers are equipped with patrol rifles of different types. There are no present outstanding issues with firearms.

The fleet consists of a total of 13 vehicles. This is a reasonable amount of vehicles considering that this includes specialty vehicles such as an incident command vehicle and a prisoner transportation van, both of which are operated infrequently and will have an extended life of service. The fleet also includes marked cruisers for patrol purposes and unmarked vehicles for administrative and investigative work.

### Police Personnel and Staffing

The Wayland Police Department is a full service agency that delivers a range of services and responses on a 24 hour a day basis. Its authorized strength in 2003 was 23. In 2004, this number was reduced to 22 where it has remained steady to the present. Sworn officers are distributed as follows: 1 chief, 1 patrol lieutenant, 1 detective sergeant, 1.5 detectives, 5 prosecutor, 5 administrative sergeant, 1 youth officer, 1 community services officer, 4.5 patrol sergeants, and 10 police officers. A number of officers have collateral duties that they perform on an as needed basis. Examples of these duties would be traffic crash investigator, bike unit officer, and computer administration.



The highest numbers of reported incidents between 2002 and 2006 were for Theft (from a building), Theft (other), and Malicious Damage to Property. The lowest numbers of reported incidents are represented by such activity as Runaways, Disorderly Conduct, and Sex related offenses.

Over the last two years there has been a recorded increase in calls for service of approximately 19% or 9.5% per year.

The guideline often used to determine the reasonableness of staffing for police agencies is the number of police officers per 1000 population. The Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) calculates the average number of police officers per 1000 population in various regions of the country, which is included it its annual *Uniform Crime Report*. Nationally, there are 2.7 officers per 1000 population. The New England average is 2.1 and is based upon a survey of 1,783 communities with between 10,000 and 24,999 residents. The Massachusetts average is 1.9.

We also did the following survey of comparable Towns to get a sense of their ratio:

### RATIO OF POLICE OFFICERS PER THOUSAND POPULATION

COMMUNITY	POPULATION	FULL-TIME OFFICERS	OFFICERS PER 1,000
Sudbury *+	18,200	29	1.59
Weston *+	11,022	.27	2.45
Bedford *+	13,000	27	2.08
Westwood *+	15,200	27	1.78
Concord *+	17,000	35	2.06
Duxbury *	14,240	29	2.10
AVERAGE RATIO+			2.0
Burlington #	22,076	62	2.7
Mashpee #	12,946	33	4.2
Hingham #	19,882	45	2.3
WAYLAND	13,100	22	1.67
NATIONAL AVERAGE			2.7
NEW ENGLAND AVERAGE			2.1

<sup>\*</sup>Towns of similar demographics

Population numbers, number of officers, and ratios were provided by the Commonwealth of Massachusetts for 2000 year census.

We do not expect that the proposed development project will result in significant operational demands upon the Police Department. However, like the Fire Department, the staffing levels for the Police Department are well below average.



<sup>#</sup> Towns with commercial developments of note

### pispatch Facilities and Equipment

The Public Safety Dispatch Center is a well equipped center located in the Public Safety Building. During our inspection it was neat, orderly, and appears to be well maintained.

### Dispatch Personnel and Staffing

The Dispatch Center appears to be staffed with well trained personnel. Two dispatchers are assigned to the day and evening shifts, usually there is one dispatcher assigned to the midnight shift. When there are two dispatchers assigned one dispatcher is assigned to each service (Police and Fire). All dispatchers are cross-trained in both services and assist each other during times of high call volume.

The vast percentage of calls for service is feed through the Communications Center via the telephone and radio. Even with the use of overtime to provide for vacation, sick, and training days, the second dispatcher position on the midnight shift is usually unfilled. While call volume and seriousness of incidents has increased since 1970, this same coverage has remained from that year to the present.

We believe that the current staffing configuration within the center results in significant risk exposure since at times it is staffed with a single dispatcher. Operational issues ranging from missed critical communications during significant events, to the entire Center being compromised should the dispatcher experience a medical emergency, are serious issues presented by single staff coverage. In Wayland, the 11P-7A shift is routinely staffed with a single dispatcher, while the 3P-11P shift is periodically staffed with a single dispatcher.

The Association of Public Safety Communications Officials (APCO) has authored a staffing study of public safety dispatch centers known as project RETAINS. This study clearly indicates that, based on current call volumes, Wayland should have two dispatchers on duty at all times.

### CONCLUSION

In our view the Wayland Police and Fire Departments, as well as the Dispatch Center, are currently understaffed. They are understaffed when compared to national, regional or statewide standards and in comparison with contiguous communities.

The Wayland Town Center project by itself will have no significant impact on public safety services. We recommend that the Town consider the opportunity that is presented by creation of new tax revenue and make appropriate staffing adjustments in the Police and Fire Departments and the Dispatch Center.



PUBLIC SAFETY

# Fewer to protect and serve

Police chiefs concerned that staffing is below national average in most area towns

### BY BRAD PETRISHEN

DAILY NEWS STAFF

Most police departments in the Milford and MetroWest area have fewer officers than regional and national averages, and a number of area chiefs say adding to their forces is long overdue.

"When you're shorthanded, it's hard, because every officer becomes very important," said Framingham Chief Steven Carl, who in March presented selectmen with a report that argued the town needs about 40 more officers.

The FBI presents an annual statistic — the number of police officers per 1,000 residents in town — that many chiefs use when evaluating

SEE POLICE, A10

Continued from page A1

the size of their departments.

A review of area staffing shows that only Weston is in line with the 2010 national average of 2.3 police officers per 1,000 residents and the 2010 New England average of 1.8.

Towns in the Milford area generally had more officers. while towns in MetroWest fell between about 1.7 and 1.2 officers per 1,000.

Marlborough and Framingham's ratios come in at just under 1.7, while Shrewsbury was the lowest department surveyed at 1.2.

Many chiefs noted they had not received a new position in years, including Northborough (1998), Holliston (2007),Hudson (2001) and Sudbury (2001).

Marlborough Chief Mark Leonard said the city hasn't increased its number of sworn officers since 1988.

Sudbury has one fewer officer than Weston, despite the fact that it has roughly 6,000 more residents.

The average among all 26 towns surveyed is about 1.6 officers per 1,000, which is below the FBI's reported average of 1.8 for New England.

While the figure of officers per thousand is often cited by police chiefs making staffing requests, FBIspokesman William Estok said the figures are not meant to be considered recommendations from agency.

Meredith Ward, spokeswoman for the International Association Chiefs of Police, said her or-

A review of area staffing shows that only Weston is in line with the 2010 national average of 2.3 police officers per 1,000 residents and the 2010 New England average of 1.8.

ganization doesn't recommend using police-officersper-1,000 as a benchmark either.

"Rather than a one-sizefits-all approach, staffing levels in individual departments should be set by an individual chief or agency head based on various attributes of the community they serve. Things like response times, types and levels of calls for service should be considered along with agency and community size. need and other individual characteristics," she said.

Although the numbers may not be the sole determinant, area chiefs say they do consider them vital to their self-assessment.

"I see them as a useful guide," said Shrewsbury Chief James Hester Jr., who saw his force cut in 2009 from 45 to 42 because of a lack of money.

Hester said the town agreed to add a 43rd officer for fiscal 2013, and he believes he is on a trend upward. He said he'd like to get back to his base of 45 and then start building from there.

"We're stretched," he said. "Certainly, the reductions have an impact on service."

Framingham Chief Carl said no matter how much stock one puts into per-resident figures, the fact is that his force needs about 30 more officers.

The town has 114 officers

and should have 118 by next April if all goes well with academy training.

In a recent presentation to selectmen, he used two other metrics to justify his belief that the town needs about 150 officers.

Carl compared Framingham to Brookline and Waltham, which he said are comparable in terms of population, demographics and the way they go about fighting crime.

Brookline has 2.2 officers per 1,000 residents while Waltham has 2.3, and both spend roughly \$80 more per capita on their fiscal 2012

police budgets.

"They have smaller populations, less square miles, and we answer more calls with more crime," Carl said. "(Yet) we have significantly fewer officers."

He also used an analysis of full-time equivalent position which shows that although the town is authorized for 118 full-time equivalents, that only equates to about 89 officers at any given time because of contractual time off and training. The town actually lost the working hours of about eight cops, he said, as a result of scheduling changes the union negotiated with the town in 2000.

"No matter how you look at it, it comes up to roughly 147 to 150 officers we need. said Carl.

Carl said the officers-per-

# Police officers per thousand residents in MetroWest

Town	Population	Officers	Officers per 1,000 residents
Weston	11,261	26	2.3
Mendon	5,839	12	2.06
Hopedale	5,911	12	2.06
Millis	7.891	15	1.9
Foxborough	16,865	30	1.78
Wrentham	10,995	19	1.73
Plainville	8,264	14	1.69
Marlborough	38,499	65	1.69
Framingham	68,318	114	1.67
Hudson	19,063	- 31	1.63
Holliston	13,547*	22	1.62
Natick	33,006	53	1.61
Milford	27,999	45	1.61
Westborough	18,272	29	1.59
Bellingham	16,332	.26	1.59
Upton	7,542	12	1.59
Ashland	16,593	26	1.57
Wayland	12,994	20	1.54
Norfolk	11,227	17	1.51
Medway	12,752	19	1.49
Southborough	9,767	14**	1.43
Sudbury	17.659	25***	1.42
Northborough	14,155	20	1.41
Franklin	31,635	44	1.39
Hopkinton	14,925	20****	1.34
Shrewsbury	35,608	43	1.21

New England average in 2010: 1.8

National average in 2010: 2.3

SOURCE: 2010 U.S. CENSUS, FBI, AREA POLICE CHIEFS

1,000 figures for Framingham might be lower during the day since so many people come into town.

"Our population swells during the day," he said, since the town has so many businesses — Genzyme, Bose and Shoppers World, for example — that draw employees and customers.

"Any kind of problem we have to respond to," he said. "We don't pull up and say,

'You're not from here? Goodbye."

The census figure also doesn't include illegal immigrants, people living in town, or people staying at hotels or motels, he said.

Carl said one remarkable statistic is that the town has five fewer officers today than a study it commissioned in 1970 recommended it have by 1990.

"In 1970, no one had even heard of crack cocaine, there were no street gangs, there were no immigration concerns," he said. "The job has changed so much."

Carl said it's important for people to realize the statistics aren't just numbers on paper, but can have life-ordeath implications.

He pointed to the recent killing of Springfield Officer Kevin Ambrose as a situation where an extra officer might have made a difference. Ambrose was shot and killed by the ex-boyfriend of a woman who called 911 saying she felt threatened.

"Maybe if they had two officers, the (shooter) wouldn't have felt he had the ability to do what he did," Carl said.

Officers in Framingham go to similar calls solo about 40 percent of the time, he said. Backup often arrives, he said, but it can take a few minutes, during which a lot can happen.

"The world is filled with what-ifs, and policing is a dangerous job," he said. "Lack of staffing makes it more dangerous."

(Brad Petrishen can be reached at 508-490-7463 or bpetrishen@wickedlocal.com. For news throughout the day, follow him at twitter.com/Brad\_Petrishen.)

<sup>\*</sup> Per Town Clerk, most recent town count puts population at 15,033, which would drop ratio to 1.46; \*\* One officer on military leave so position filled with OT; \*\*\* Eventual 26th officer traning in academy; \*\*\*\* Approved to add 21st officer in 2013